

Name of commenter: \_\_\_\_\_

Name of paper author: \_\_\_\_\_

| Rubric   | thoughts and comments |
|--|-----------------------|
| <b>Thesis:</b>   |                       |
| Can you identify a single sentence that contains the thesis? If not, ask your partner to identify it for you.                          |                       |
| Is the thesis concise?   |                       |
| Does the thesis say clearly how the chosen ethical theory applies to the issue at hand?  |                       |
| Is the thesis appropriately specific—does it give you some indication about the main arguments in favor of the position it recommends? |                       |
| <b>Arguments:</b>  |                       |
| Does each of the arguments clearly support the thesis?   |                       |
| Do the arguments show understanding of the ethical theory they are applying?   |                       |
| Do the arguments demonstrate a thoughtful and informed view of the issue to which they are applied?                                    |                       |
| Does the paper use appropriate readings and ideas from class to explain the theory and the issue to which it has been applied?         |                       |
| Are the arguments persuasive?  |                       |
| <b>Objections:</b>   |                       |
| Does the paper anticipate a plausible objection?   |                       |
| Does the paper provide a convincing response to the objection?   |                       |