

ENG 1101-D381
Prof. Rosen
Peer Review for Project #4
25 November 2013

Peer review is an excellent way to offer classmates your attention, and to say what you understand and don't understand, how the essay meets requirements and what you can't find, and how it interested you or revealed the author's lack of interest. If the author means one thing, but you as the reader take something else away from reading the essay, then there is a great place for revision.

Focus:

How does the essay begin? Look at the first sentence and decide if it's on topic, an appropriate lead-in to the topic, or too broad for the topic. If it's a lead-in, where do you learn what the topic is? Write TOPIC in the margin where you first understand the topic. The topic is most likely the location.

Where is it clear to you what the stories or story versions will be about? There should be some indication in the introduction. If it is clear, write STORY 1 and STORY 2 in the margins there. If it is not clear, indicate where you think they could be included in a few words in the introduction.

Where is the thesis statement? Underline it and write THESIS in the margin. What does the thesis statement do for the essay? Does it indicate what the stories are or how they compare, or the theme or ideas of the comparisons? Remember, a thesis statement is an opinion, a claim, that will act as a road-map to the essay by showing your reader what to expect. It might follow the format of showing how despite similarities, there is a difference between the stories, or that despite differences, there is a similarity between the stories. Or it could follow a different format.

How can the author revise the thesis statement? What do you understand from their claim, and what additional information do you need?

Scope:

Does the essay focus on one location? What is it?

Is the location near City Tech, or, if not, has the author gotten permission to pursue a far-off location?

Where in the essay do you learn what that location is?

Does the essay tell two stories (or two versions of a story) about that location?

Does the essay compare the two stories/versions? Where? Write COMPARISON in the margin where you find it. Remember, comparison means examining the similarities and/or differences.

Length:

Does the essay seem to be roughly 1000-1200 words (typically 3-4 pages), or is it shorter? Longer?

What seems to be missing?

What might the author cut?

Is there a section that is much longer or much shorter than the others? Offer suggestions for bringing that section into balance with the others.

Stories:

Is it clear whose story the first one is, and what sources the author used to tell the story?

Is it interesting to you?

Is it interesting to the author?

Is it clear whose story the second one is, and what sources the author used to retell the story?

Is it interesting to you?

Is it interesting to the author?

Comparison:

Which organizational plan does this essay use for the comparison?

Does the comparison convey both similarities and differences?

Are the points of the comparison significant? Interesting?

What else might the author include in the comparison?

Sources:

How do you know what sources were used?

Are there at least 4 sources used?

Is there a Works Cited list?

Are there in-text citations, either integrated into sentences or in parentheses using MLA format?

Do the sources seem credible? Why or why not?

Is there any instance in which the sources are not cited, or too much language is taken directly from sources without quotation marks?

What suggestions can you make for improving the sources or the use of sources?

Lower-order concerns:

Typically, we leave editing the language of the essay—the sentence structure, vocabulary, punctuation, spelling, etc—to the end, unless it interferes with the author's ability to be understood or to express the ideas that make up the essay.

If you don't understand the author's language as it is written, where does it become difficult?

Are there any suggestions you have for the author beginning the editing process?

Title:

Does the title match the essay?

If it is too general, or too vague, how can the author revise it to make it a better fit?

Re-Outlining:

Write an outline of the essay, using paragraphs as outline sections. This can help show if the essay does what the author thinks it does.

Would you change the organization of the essay? If so, make suggestions. If not, explain why the organization works.

Say-back:

Write what this essay is about in approximately one paragraph. When you discuss the essay, it will be helpful to show the author what you understood and what you might have missed.

Last words:

Is there anything else you would like to let the author know?